

**RISK ASSESSMENT REPORT
OF THE GENETIC MODIFICATION
ADVISORY COMMITTEE (GMAC)**

FOR

**AN APPLICATION FOR APPROVAL FOR RELEASE
OF PRODUCTS OF MZIR098 CORN FOR SUPPLY
OR OFFER TO SUPPLY**

NBB REF NO: JBK(S) 602-1/1/42

**APPLICANT: SYNGENTA CROP PROTECTION
SDN. BHD.**

DATE: 4 APRIL 2018

I - Summary of Assessment Process

On 16 January 2018, the Genetic Modification Advisory Committee (GMAC, please refer to Appendix 1 for details of GMAC), received from the Department of Biosafety an application for the approval for importation for release [sale/placing on the market for direct use as food, feed and for processing (FFP)] of a product of a Living Modified Organism insect-resistant and herbicide-tolerant MZIR098 corn. The application was filed by Syngenta Crop Protection Sdn. Bhd. (hereafter referred to as “the applicant”). After an initial review, GMAC requested for additional information from the applicant.

A public consultation for this application was conducted from 1 December 2017 to 30 December 2017 via advertisements in the local newspapers. Comments were received from Third World Network (TWN). GMAC took into consideration comments regarding molecular characterization, safety assessment and glufosinate herbicide toxicity concerns in imported MZIR098 corn.

GMAC had four (4) meetings pertaining to this application and prepared the Risk Assessment Report and Risk Assessment Matrix along with its recommended decision, for consideration by the National Biosafety Board.

II - Background of Application

This application is for approval to import and release products of a Living Modified Organism insect-resistant and herbicide-tolerant MZIR098 corn. The aim of the import and release is to supply or offer to supply for sale/placing on the market for direct use as food, feed and for processing (FFP). According to the applicant, MZIR098 corn has been registered in a number of countries for cultivation as well as for food, feed and for processing. MZIR098 corn was first approved in 2016 for cultivation and FFP in the United States of America and Canada, followed by approval for food in Australia and New Zealand. The type of expected use of the products derived from MZIR098 corn in Malaysia will be the same as the expected usage for products derived from conventional corn. Potential users of products derived from MZIR098 corn such as grains are feed millers, food processors and other industrial use.

Information about MZIR098 corn

The recipient or parental plant is *Zea mays* L.spp *mays* (field or sweet corn). Corn is extensively cultivated and has a long history of safe use as a food or feed. It is one of the largest cultivated crop in the world followed by wheat (*Triticum* sp.) and rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) in total global metric ton production (FAOSTAT, 2016).

MZIR098 corn produces eCry3.1Ab and mCry3A proteins expressed by the genes *ecry3.1Ab* and *mcry3A* derived from *B. thuringiensis*, conferring the insect resistant trait (corn rootworm, *Diabrotica* spp.) and *phosphinothricin acetyltransferase* (PAT) protein expressed by the *pat-08* derived from *Streptomyces viridochromogenes* which confers glufosinate-ammonium herbicide tolerance.

III - Risk Assessment and Risk Management Plan

GMAC evaluated the application with reference to the following documents:

- (i) CODEX Guideline for the Conduct of Food Safety Assessment of Foods Derived from Recombinant-DNA Plants.
- (ii) Roadmap for Risk Assessment of Living Modified Organisms, (according to Annex III of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety produced by the *Ad Hoc* Technical Expert Group (AHTEG) on Risk Assessment and Risk Management of the Convention on Biological Diversity).
- (iii) The risk assessment and risk management plan submitted by the applicant.

GMAC also referred to the following recommendations within the AHTEG guidelines:

- (i) That the risk assessment exercise be specific to the details of this particular application
- (ii) That the risk assessment exercise be specific to the receiving environment in question, and
- (iii) That any risk identified be compared against that posed by the unmodified organism.

In conducting the risk assessment, GMAC identified potential hazards, and then added a value/rank for the likelihood of each hazard as well as its consequences. The likelihood of each

hazard occurring was evaluated qualitatively on a scale of 1 to 4, with 1 for 'highly unlikely', and 4 for 'highly likely'. The consequences of each hazard, if it were to occur, were then evaluated on a scale of 1 to 4, with 1 for 'marginal' and 4 to denote a 'major consequence'. A value was finally assigned for the overall risk from the identified potential hazard. The general formula: Overall Risk = Likelihood x Consequence was employed. GMAC also proposed risk management strategies for potential hazards, where appropriate. This methodology of assessment follows the procedure of Risk Assessment in Annex III of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety.

The potential hazards were identified in three main areas:

(i) **Effects on human health**

Relevant scientific publications on the genetic modifications were reviewed for potential human health risks and issues pertaining to acute toxicity of novel protein / altering / interference of metabolic pathways, potential allergenicity of the novel protein, production of proteins or metabolites with mutagenic / teratogenic / carcinogenic effects, reproductive toxicity, potential transfer of antibiotic resistance genes in digestive tract, pathogenic potential of donor microorganisms, nutritional equivalence and anti-nutritional content.

(ii) **Effects on animal health**

Issues pertaining to allergenicity, toxicity, survivability and animal product contamination.

(iii) **Effects on the environment**

Issues pertaining to accidental release of seeds, unintentional release and planting, potential of transgenes being transferred to bacteria (soil bacteria, bacterial flora of animal gut), increased fitness, weediness and invasiveness, accumulation of the protein in the environment via feces from animals fed with the GM plant/grain, cross pollination leading to transfer of transgenes, toxic effect on non-target organisms and potential interactions of the multiple gene inserts resulting in undesirable effects on non-target organisms were examined.

Based on the above, a final list of 22 potential hazards was identified. Most of these hazards were rated as having an Overall Risk of 1 or "negligible".

GMAC also took caution and discussed a few of the hazards that required further evaluation and data acquisition. Some of these risks are expected to be managed effectively with the risk management strategies proposed (please refer to section IV of this document).

Some of the potential hazards are highlighted below along with the appropriate management strategies:

a) Accidental release of viable seeds

Seeds may be accidentally released during transportation. These seeds can germinate and grow along transportation routes and in areas surrounding storage and processing facilities (JBK Report Number No. 04, 2015). In the conducive warm and humid climate of Malaysia, there is a high likelihood of these volunteers maturing to the flowering and seed-setting stages. Although corn is not grown as an economic crop in Malaysia and there is no wild relatives, some varieties of baby corn and sweet corn are cultivated on small scales. Thus, there is a likelihood of outcrossing of the GM corn with these cultivated corns. Repeated cycles of spill-and-growth also increase the likelihood for the development of feral GM populations.

b) Planting of seeds

Plants may be grown by uninformed farmers and perpetuated through small scale cultivations. These GM corn may pollinate the non-GM baby corn and/or sweetcorn. There should also be clear labeling of the product to state that it is only for the purpose of food, feed and processing, and is not to be used as planting material.

c) Compromised nutritional content

Compositional analyses of the forage and grain samples showed no significant difference in nutritional composition between MZIR098 corn and conventional corn.

However, applicant is required to update the National Biosafety Board immediately if additional tests indicate potential adverse effects or the possible presence of toxin or allergenic proteins.

IV - Proposed Terms and Conditions for Certificate of Approval

Based on the 22 potential hazards identified and assessed, GMAC has drawn up the following terms and conditions to be included in the certificate of approval for the release of this product:

- a) There shall be clear documentation by the exporter describing the product which shall be declared to the Royal Malaysian Customs.
- b) There shall be clear labeling of the product from importation to all levels of marketing stating that it is only for the purpose of food, feed and processing, and is not to be used as planting material.

- c) Should the approved person receives any credible and/or scientifically proven information that indicates any adverse effect of MZIR098 corn, the National Biosafety Board shall be informed immediately (for a review as in Section 18 of the Biosafety Act).
- d) Any spillage (during loading/unloading/transportation) shall be collected and cleaned up immediately.
- e) Transportation of the consignment from the port of entry to any destination within the country shall be in secured and closed condition.

V - Other Regulatory Considerations

- a) Administrative regulatory procedures shall be arranged between the Department of Biosafety, Royal Malaysian Customs Department and relevant agencies to ensure accurate declaration of product information and clear labeling of the product is implemented.
- b) Administrative regulatory procedures shall be arranged between the Department of Biosafety and the Malaysian Quarantine and Inspection Services (MAQIS) to impose post entry requirements for accidental spillage involving the GM product.
- c) Administrative regulatory procedures shall be arranged between the Department of Biosafety and the Malaysian Quarantine and Inspection Services (MAQIS) and other competent agencies to impose post entry requirements for food safety compliance.
- d) Administrative regulatory arrangements shall be carried out between the Department of Biosafety and the Department of Veterinary Services (DVS) so that any unanticipated adverse effects in animals caused by any consumption of the GM products shall be reported immediately.
- e) Administrative regulatory arrangements shall be carried out by Food Safety and Quality of Ministry of Health to monitor compliance to the Food Regulations 1985 for labelling of GM food.
- f) Administrative regulatory procedures shall be arranged between Department of Biosafety and Ministry of Health to ensure that herbicide residues in corn consignments are below the acceptable maximum residual level established. It is recommended that importers are required to provide certificate of analysis for herbicide residues prior to shipment.

VI - Identification of issues to be addressed for long term use release of this product

- a) Continuous monitoring is required from the approved person and any unanticipated adverse effect caused by the MZIR098 corn shall be reported to the National Biosafety Board

VII –Conclusion and Recommendation

GMAC has conducted a thorough evaluation of the application for approval for importation for release [sale/placing on the market for direct use as food, feed and for processing (FFP)] of a product of a Living Modified Organism insect-resistant and herbicide-tolerant MZIR098 corn and has determined that the release of this product does not endanger biological diversity or human, animal and plant health. GMAC recommends that the proposed application for release be **APPROVED WITH TERMS AND CONDITIONS** as listed in section IV - Proposed Terms and Conditions for Certificate of Approval.

VIII - Bibliography

1. Andersson MS, de Vicente MC (2010). Maize, Corn (*Zea mays* L.). In Gene Flow between Crops and Their Wild Relatives. The Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, pp 255-291
2. Burns and Raybould (2014). Nontarget organisms effects test on eCry3.1Ab and their application to the ecological risk assessment for cultivation of Event 5307 maize. *Transgenic Research* 23(6): 985-994.
3. CFIA (1994). The biology of *zea mays* (L.) (maize). BIO1994-11. <http://www.inspection.gc.ca/english/plaveg/bio/dd/dd9933e.shtml>
4. Conner et al. (2003). The Release of Genetically Modified Crops into the Environment. *Plant J.* 2003 Jan;33(1):1-18
5. de Vries J, Wackernagel W (2004). Microbial horizontal gene transfer and the DNA release from transgenic crop plants. *Plant and Soil* 266: 91-104
6. FAO-WHO. 1991. Strategies for assessing the safety of foods produced by biotechnology. *Report of joint FAO/WHO consultation*. World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland.
7. FAO-WHO. 2001. Evaluation of allergenicity of genetically modified foods. *Report of a joint FAO/WHO expert consultation on allergenicity of foods derived from biotechnology*. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, Italy.
8. Galinat, W.C. 1988. The origin of corn. Pages 1-31 in *Corn and Corn Improvement. Third Edition*. G.F. Sprague and J.W. Dudley (eds.). American Society of Agronomy, Inc., Crop Science Society of America, Inc., Soil Science Society of America, Inc., Madison, Wisconsin.
9. Goodman, M.M. 1988. The history and evolution of maize. *Critical Reviews in Plant Sciences*. 7: 197-220.
10. Hérouet C, Esdaile DJ, Mallyon BA, Debruyne E, Schulz A, Currier T, Hendrickx K, van der Klis R-J, Rouan D. (2005). Safety evaluation of the phosphinothricin acetyltransferase proteins encoded by the *pat* and *bar* sequences that confer tolerance to glufosinate-ammonium herbicide in transgenic plants. *Regulatory Toxicology and Pharmacology* 41:134–149.

11. ILSI. 2011a. A Review of the Environmental Safety of the PAT Protein. Washington DC: Center for Environmental Risk Assessment, International Life Sciences Institute Research Foundation. http://cera-gmc.org/docs/cera_publications/pub_05_2011.pdf
12. Kees, P. (2008). Risk from GMOs due to Horizontal Gene Transfer. *Environ Biosafety Res.* 2008 Jul-Sep;7(3):123-49. doi: 10.1051/ebr:2008014
13. Luna, V. S., J. Figueroa, M., B. Baltazar, M., R. Gomez, L., R. Townsend, and J. B. Schoper. (2001). Maize pollen longevity and distance isolation requirements for effective pollen control. *Crop Sci.* 41:1551–1557
14. Messeguer, J., Salvia, J., Palauelmàs, M., Melé, E., Serra, J., Peñas, G. et. al. (2006). Pollen-mediated gene flow in maize in real situations of coexistence. *Plant Biotech J* 4: 633–645.
15. Nielsen, K.M. (1998). Barriers to horizontal gene transfer by natural transformation in soil bacteria. *APMIS* 106: 77-84
16. Nielsen, K.M., Bones, A.M., Smalla, K., van Elsas, J.D. (1998). Horizontal gene transfer from transgenic plants to terrestrial bacteria – a rare event? *FEMS Microbiology Reviews* 22: 79-103
17. Nielsen, K.M., Van Elsas, J.D., Smalla, K. (2000). Transformation of *Acinetobacter* sp. Strain BD413 (pFG4ΔnptII) with Transgenic Plant DNA in Soil Microcosms and Effects of Kanamycin on Selection of Transformants. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 66: 1237-1242.
18. OECD (2003). Consensus Document on the Biology of *Zea mays* subsp. *Mays* (maize). ENV/JM/MONO(2003)11. Series on Harmonisation of Regulatory Oversight in Biotechnology, No. 27. Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Paris, France.
19. Raybould A, Stacey D, Vlachos D, Graser G, Li X, Joseph R. (2007). Non-target organism risk assessment of MIR604 maize expressing mCry3A for control of corn rootworm. *J Appl Entomol* 131:391-399.
20. Shaw, R.H., 1988. Climate requirement. In: Sprague, G.F., Stelly, M., Fuccillo, D.A., Perelman, L.S., Dudley, J.W. (Eds.), *Corn and corn improvement*. American Society of Agronomy, Madison, WI, pp. 609-638

21. Wehrmann A, van Vliet A, Opsomer C, Botterman J, Schulz A. (1996). The similarities of bar and pat gene products make them equally applicable for plant engineers. *Nature Biotechnology* 14:1274–1278.
22. Acute Oral Toxicity Study of Modified Cry3A Protein (MCRY3A-0102) in the Mouse” (2003) Central Toxicology Laboratory Study No. AM7301.
23. Dröge W, Broer I, Pühler A. (1992). Transgenic plants containing the phosphinothricin-N-acetyltransferase gene metabolize the herbicide L-phosphinothricin (glufosinate) differently from untransformed plants. *Plants* 187:142-151
24. Thompson CJ, Movva NR, Tichard R, Cramer R, Davies JE, Lauwereys M, Botterman J. (1987). Characterization of the herbicide-resistance gene bar from *Streptomyces hygroscopicus*. *The EMBO Journal* 6:2519–2523.
25. Walters FS, Stacy CM, Lee MK, Palekar N, Chen JS. (2008). An engineered chymotrypsin/cathepsin G site in domain I renders *Bacillus thuringiensis* Cry3A active against western corn rootworm larvae *Appl Environ Microbiol* 74:367-374.
26. Walters, FS, deFontes CM, Hart H, Warren GW, Chen JS. (2010). Lepidopteran-active variable-region sequence imparts coleopteran activity in eCry3.1Ab, an engineered *Bacillus thuringiensis* hybrid insecticidal protein. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 76:3082-3088.
27. Wehrmann A, van Vliet A, Opsomer C, Botterman J, Schulz A. (1996). The similarities of bar and pat gene products make them equally applicable for plant engineers. *Nature Biotechnology* 14:1274–1278.
28. In vitro Digestibility of eCry3.1Ab Protein under Simulated Mammalian Gastric Conditions TK0028111. (2010) .Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
29. In vitro Digestibility of eCry3.1Ab Protein as Contained in Test Substance ECRY3.1AB-0208 under Simulated Mammalian Intestinal Conditions. SSB-015-09 A1 (2010) .Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
30. In vitro Digestibility of Modified Cry3A Protein (MCRY3A-0102 and IAPMIR604-0103) Under Simulated Mammalian Gastric Conditions SSB-029-03 A1 (2005). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).

31. In vitro Digestibility of Modified Cry3A Protein from Test Substances MCRY3A-0102 and MCRY3A-SF-0106 under Simulated Mammalian Intestinal Conditions SSB-169-06 (2006) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
32. In vitro Digestibility of Phosphinothricin Acetyltransferase (PAT) Protein under Simulated Mammalian Gastric Conditions TK0062551 (2012). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
33. In vitro Digestibility of Phosphinothricin Acetyltransferase (PAT) Protein under Simulated Mammalian Intestinal Conditions TK0030220 (2010). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
34. MZIR098 Evaluation of MZIR098 Transgenic Maize Grain in a Broiler Chicken Feeding Study Final Report TK0253665 (2017). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
35. eCry3.1Ab-0208: Single-Dose Oral (Gavage) Toxicity Study in Mice with a 14-Day Observation Period” (2009) .Toxicology Laboratory Study No. WIL-639031
36. PAT: Acute Oral (Gavage) Toxicity Study in Mice with a 14 Day Observation Period. Report No. WIL-639181
37. Effect of Temperature on the Immunoreactivity of eCry3.1Ab Protein TK0022186 (2010) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
38. Effect of Temperature on the Bioactivity of eCry3.1Ab Protein as Contained in Test Substance ECRY3.1AB-0208. SSB-014-09 A1. (2010). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
39. mCry3A Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Toxins Assessment. Report SSB- 129-17. (2017) .Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
40. mCry3A Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Allergens Assessment. Report SSB-128-17. (2017). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
41. Effect of Temperature on the Stability of Modified Cry3A Protein from Test Substances MCRY3A-0102 and MCRY3A-SF-0106. SSB-108-07 (2007). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
42. Effect of Temperature on the Stability of Modified Cry3A Protein MCRY3A-0102. SSB-030-03 (2003) .Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished)

43. Effect of Temperature on the Immunoreactivity of Phosphinothricin Acetyltransferase (PAT). TK0062552 (2013) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
44. Effect of Temperature on the Enzymatic Activity of of Phosphinothricin Acetyltransferase (PAT) Protein. TK0062552 (2012) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
45. Compositional analysis of forage and grain from MZIR098 Maize grown during 2013 in the USA. Report TK0117452 A1 (2014). Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished)
46. eCry3.1Ab Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Toxins Assessment. Report SSB- 127-17. (2017) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
47. eCry3.1Ab Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Allergens Assessment. Report SSB- 126-17. (2017) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
48. PAT (*pat*) Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Toxins Assessment. Report SSB- 133-17. (2017) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).
49. PAT (*pat*) Assessment of Amino Acid Sequence Similarity to Known or Putative Allergens Assessment. Report SSB- 132-17. (2017) Syngenta Biotechnology, Inc. (unpublished).

**GENETIC MODIFICATION ADVISORY COMMITTEE (GMAC) MEMBERS INVOLVED IN
RISK ASSESSMENT FOR THE APPROVAL FOR RELEASE OF PRODUCTS OF
MZIR098 CORN FOR SUPPLY OR OFFER TO SUPPLY**

Genetic Modification Advisory Committee (GMAC) members divided the task of looking up more information for the Risk Assessment matrix based on three broad categories which were environment, human health and animal health. The GMAC members involved in the risk assessment are as below:

- **Dr. Ahmad Parveez bin Hj Ghulam Kadir (Malaysian Palm Oil Board)
(GMAC Chairman)**
- **Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mohd. Faiz Foong bin Abdullah (Universiti Teknologi MARA)
(Environment sub-committee leader)**
- **Madam T.S. Saraswathy (Previously from Institute for Medical Research)
(Human health sub-committee leader)**
- **Prof. Dr Jothi Malar Panandam (Previously from Universiti Putra Malaysia)
(Animal health sub-committee leader)**
- Dato' Dr. Sim Soon Liang (Academy of Sciences Malaysia)
- Dr. Rahizan binti Issa (Institute for Medical Research)
- Dr. Kodi Isparan Kandasamy (Malaysian Bioeconomy Development Corporation Sdn. Bhd.)
- Madam Atikah binti Abdul Kadir Jailani (Previously from Department of Agriculture)
- Dr. Norliza Tendot binti Abu Bakar (Malaysian Agricultural Research & Development Institute)
- Dr. Adiratna binti Mat Ripen (Institute for Medical Research)
- Dr. Norwati binti Muhammad (Forest Research Institute of Malaysia)
- Madam Laila Rabaah binti Ahmad Suhaimi (Ministry of Health)
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Chan Kok Gan (Universiti Malaya)
- Prof. Dr. Abd Rahman Milan (Universiti Malaysia Sabah)
- Assoc. Prof. Dr. Choong Chee Yen (Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia)
- Dr. Teo Tze Min (Entomological Society of Malaysia)
- Dr Saifullizam bin Abd Kadir (Department of Veterinary Services Malaysia)
- Madam Elliza binti Mat Noor (Department of Chemistry Malaysia)